

**Business Services** Organisation

## **Directorate of Legal Services**

PRACTITIONERS IN LAW TO THE HEALTH & SOCIAL CARE SECTOR

2 Franklin Street, Belfast, BT2 8DQ DX 2842 NR Belfast 3

Your Ref:

Our Ref: HYP B04/01 Date: 13.04.12

Ms A Dillon Solicitor to the Inquiry Arthur House **41 Arthur Street** Belfast BT1 4GB

RECEIVED 13 APR 2012 INQ-0868-12

Dear Madam,

## **RE: INQUIRY INTO HYPONATRAEMIA RELATED DEATHS**

I refer to the above and the opening statement presented by Senior Counsel to the Inquiry in the case of Adam Strain. I am instructed that the Trust wishes to assist the Inquiry in establishing the facts and there were several areas of Senior Counsel's opening Statement which the Trust would wish to address. I am instructed as follows: -

1. It was stated (paragraph 81) that you are still investigating which dates the various anaesthetic teams carried out renal transplants in RBHSC between 1.04.93 and 13.10.10. Please note that the Trust has not been asked for this information it has however been asked to provide the names of the teams. Listed below are the dates which attach to the anaesthetic teams which were provided to the Inquiry in our letter of 16<sup>th</sup> December 2010 (AD-0156-10).

The anaesthetic teams involved were:

Bhann/Paxton (1) (16.06.96), Crean (2) (27.09.95, 29.07.97), Crean/Hill (1) (17.11.95), Taylor/Montague (1) (27.11.95), Bhann (1) (24.07.96), Taylor/McConaghy (1) (06.11.96), Taylor/McCloskey (1) (01.08.97), McKaigue/Campbell (1) (22.02.98), Chisakuta/McKaigue (1) (22.04.98), McAtamney/McCabe (1) (19.03.99), McAtamney/Chisakuta (1) (26.04.99), Crean/Molloy (1) (15.09.99), McAteer (1) (31.03.00),

Providing Support to Health and Social Care







Keaney (1) (17.07.00), Lyons/Gormley (1) (10.11.00), Bedi/Lyons (1) (02.03.01), Lyons/Morris (1) (04.02.02), Lyons/Stafford (1) (21.03.02), Chisakuta/Mahajan (1) (21.10.02), Chisakuta/Stafford (1) (21.11.02), Chisakuta/McMorrow (1) (21.04.03), Chogle (1) (25.10.03), Symington/Chisakuta/Dripps (1) (01.07.04), Chisakuta/Dripps (1) (31.07.04), Chisakuta/Kamiah (1) (12.01.05), Chisakuta/Sims (1) (19.01.05), Chogle/Taylor (1) (26.09.05), Taylor/Cavanagh (1) (03.11.06), Robinson/McAlonan (1) (22.12.07), Robinson/Hendron (1) (13.04.08), Chisakuta/Mishra/Kansor (1) (10.05.08), Taylor/Cooke (1) (05.02.09), Lipczynski (2) (15.06.09), Crean/Lyons (1) (04.01.10), Robinson (1) (04.02.10), Chisakuta (1) (15.02.10), Chisakuta/Mottram (1) (22.03.10), Lipczynski/Mottram (1) (02.05.10), Robinson/Shevlin (1) (07.07.10), Taylor/Campbell (1) (06.09.10), Chisakuta/Curry (1) (22.09.10), Robinson/Kelly (1) (13.10.10). (8 Anaesthetic Teams could not be identified, 07.10.93, 27.02.96, 28.08.96, 26.05.97, 09.02.99, 23.02.05, 08.08.07, 31.08.09).

- In relation to the reference (paragraph 171) to Mr. B. McLaughlin, Mr. J. Wilson and Dr. Gibson carrying out the inspection in the RBHSC theatre on 2<sup>nd</sup> December 1995 it should be noted that these members of Trust staff were from the Royal Victoria Hospital
- Gibson carrying out the inspection in the RBHSC theatre on 2<sup>nd</sup> December 1995 it should be noted that these members of Trust staff were from the Royal Victoria Hospital and not the Royal Belfast Hospital for Sick Children.
- 3. It was stated at paragraph 242 that the Inquiry was not clear how Mr. Brown came to be involved in Adam Strain's renal transplant surgery. I would refer you to our letter of 17<sup>th</sup> February 2012 which encloses copies of the RBHSC theatre log for November and December 1995. These show that on Monday mornings (6.11.95, 13.11.95, 27.11.95,

4.12.95, and 18.12.95 Mr. Brown had an operating list. On 20.11.95 a single thoracic surgery operation was performed by a consultant from the RVH instead of Mr. Brown's list. There was no operating list on 11.12.95 or 25.12.95 (Christmas day). The Trust believes that the primary reason Mr. Brown was in theatre on the morning of 27<sup>th</sup> November 1995 was to perform his routine operating list which in order to assist Mr. Keane he delegated to his surgical trainee and he performed only the last operation on his own list at 12.15 pm.

There was only one operating list each Monday morning in November and December 1995 except for 27.11.95 when the extra operating list occurred for Adam Strain's renal transplant. The anaesthetists involved on a Monday morning during November and December 1995 were the consultant Dr. Campbell and a trainee anaesthetist (Dr. McBrien or Dr. Montague or Dr. Hill). There was therefore no requirement to roster a second trainee to theatre on Monday mornings as there was only routinely one operating list running. If a second trainee anaesthetist had attended theatre at 9.00am on Monday morning 27.11.95 to assist Dr. Taylor it would most likely have been by way of a special arrangement as he/she would otherwise have had no duties to perform there on a normal Monday morning.

- 4. The Trust has noticed errors in the pages from the theatre log copies previously supplied caused due to the necessity to join pages from the large logbook. I now enclose pages for 14.11.95/15.11.95 (not previously supplied) and corrected pages for 10.11.95/13.11.95 and 22.11.95/23.11.95 (copied incorrectly). The Trust apologies for these errors.
- It would appear that the reference to an operation on 9<sup>th</sup> February 1992, at Para 72 (p26), is erroneous and it is believed the correct date should be 29th May 1992. Furthermore it is unclear from the wording what exactly McCallion and Stewart have not accepted. I would be obliged if you could clarify this matter.

Yours faithfully,

Joanna Bolton Solicitor Consultant Email:

La companya da			antal diamana ang anang ang ang ang ang ang ang an						,
		MON	TH wovenby	er YEAR 1995					
DATE OF OPERATION	FATHEN! DETAILS	CI4CN)	CSIS	PROCEDURE OPERATION	CLASSIFICATION OF GRENATION	SURGEON	ANAESTHETIC	ANAESTHETIST	WARD NUMBER
12-11-95									
10-11-95									
10-11-95									
0 11 SE									
10/1/1/2									
oluls .									
10/11/95.									
11/11/95									
12/ 11/55 B-11-95									
13-11-95									
13-11-95									
13-11-95									
B-11-95 13-11-95									
B-11-95									
13-11-95									
B-11-95 13-11-95									
13-11-95		. *							
B-71-25									
_13-11-95									
13-11-95	· · · ·								
									Designation and the state of th
		A second s				Contraction of Contra	na na mana ang ang ang ang ang ang ang ang ang		

	1
SCRUB NURSE ARRIVAL DEPARTURE IMPLANT OP TIME TIME No.	ERATIO No.

.

301-124-685

	,	MONTH Noven	Now YEAR 1995		;	T				ARRIVAL TIME	DEPARTURE	IMPLANT No.	OPERA No.
	PATIENT DETAILS	DIAGNOSIS	PROCEDURE OPERATION	CLASSIFICATIC OF OPERATION	SURGEON	ANAESTHETIC	ANAESTHETIST	WARD NUMBER	SCRUB NURSE	TIME	TIME		
	PATENT DE AILS												
15	•												
<u>5                                    </u>													
· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·													
15													
15 5 95 {													
<u></u>													
T													
5 195	:												
95 5													
ſ													
·····													
5													
45 195 195													
195													
1/95													
195													
11/23													
.95													
1. 95													
=													
· · · · · · · · · · · ·					1951-103 - 1023-104 1	,							
					Barr - 15,200			-					

301-124-686

## AS - INQ

							i.				
			н. 1		· .						
	MONTH	YEAR					<u> </u>		ARRIVAL DEPAR	TURE IMPLANT IE No.	OPERATION No.
			CLASSIFICATIO OF OPERATION	SURGEON	ANAESTHETIC	ANAESTHETIST	WARD NUMBER	SCRUB NURSE	ARRIVAL DEPAR TIME TIN	IE No.	NO.
DATE OF PATIENT DETAILS OPERATION	DIAGNOSIȘ	PROCEDURE/OPERATION	OPERATION				1		1 1		
22.11-95											
2211 95											
22.11-95											
<u> </u>											
22.11.95											
22.11.95											
22-11-95											
23.11-95											
13 11.93											
2311.95											
23.11.95											
<u>ao 11 17 1</u>											
23.11.95											
23·11 95											
<u> </u>											
~ ~ ~											
<u> </u>											
<u>11 m 44</u>											
<u> </u>											
<u> </u>											
23.11.35											
231195											
				ř.	ł		l.	ι		'. 	
	1										
		· .									
AS - INQ	•							₩₩₩₩₩₩₩₩₩₩₩₩₩₩₩₩₩₩₩₩₩₩₩₩₩₩₩₩₩₩₩₩₩₩₩₩₩₩		30	1-124-687
										er en	