

NAME OF CHILD: Claire Roberts

Name: Michael Shields

Title: Dr

Present position and institution:

Professor of Child Health, Queen's University Belfast &
Consultant Paediatrician, Belfast HSC Trust

Previous position and institution:

[As at the time of the child's death on 23rd October 1996]

Senior Lecturer, Queen's University Belfast &
Consultant Paediatrician, Royal Belfast Hospital for Sick Children, Belfast HSC Trust

Membership of Advisory Panels and Committees:

[Identify by date and title all of those between October 1996 - October 2012]

- (1) Medical Audit Coordinator for the Royal Belfast Hospital for Sick Children (RBHSC), 1992-96.
- (2) King's Fund Organisational Audit Steering Group, Royal Group Hospitals, Belfast, 1995-98.
- (3) Chair, Research Committee, Royal Belfast Hospital for Sick Children (RBHSC) 2001- 2003
- (4) Co-Chair Division Maternal and Child Health Research Committees 2003-8
- (5) Paediatric Directorate Medical Records Subcommittee (RBHSC) 1998-2001
- (6) Deputy Chair and founding Principal Investigator Child Health & Welfare Recognised Research Grouping, DHSSNI.
- (7) NI Clinical Research Network (Children's), 2006 - , founding member
- (8) Belfast HSC Trust. Research Overview Group / Research Permissions committee. 2009-
- (9) Belfast HSC Trust Research Advisory Group. 2010-

Royal College Paediatrics & Child Health (RCPCH)

- Paediatric Tutor, Royal College of Paediatrics and Child Health, 1998-2002
 - Deputy Regional Advisor (RCPCH), N Ireland, 2002-2005
 - Regional Advisor (RCPCH), N Ireland, 2005-
 - Flexible Training Coordinator (Paediatrics) 2005-
 - Committee member N Ireland Regional Committee RCPCH 2005-
 - Academic Council of the Ireland Committee of the Royal College Paediatrics and Child Health. 2001-
 - N Ireland and academic representative CSAC-Respiratory Paediatrics (training inspection visits, competency assessments, National grid interviews, appraisals)
 - CSAC Paediatrics N.Ireland
- (10) Allergy Care Pathways, Asthma & Allergy care pathway Working Group.

<http://www.rcpch.ac.uk/Research/Research-Activity/Current-Projects/Allergy-Care-Pathways/ACP->

- [AsthmaAllergicRhinitis](#).

Northern Ireland Council Postgraduate Medical & Dental Education/ NIMDTA

- Chair, Paediatric Training Committee, NIMDTA 2005-8
- Paediatric Training Committee member, NI Council for Postgraduate Medical and Dental Education, 1998-2008
- Annual assessment and appraisal of paediatric SpRs.
- Lead Trainor Respiratory Training (RBHSC)
- Paediatric Workforce Planning Group, DHSSNI, 1998 -2008
- Provincial Paediatric Speciality Advisory Group, 1998 -
- Speciality Advisor for Paediatrics, N Ireland 2002-2007
- Paediatric Representative on the 'SHO Modernization Group' 2002-7

Other Regional (N Ireland)

- Chair: N Ireland Regional Respiratory Advisory Group 2011-
- Chair: N Ireland paediatric respiratory & allergy network; 2008-
- Respiratory Health & Wellbeing Service Framework Project Team member 2007-
- Paediatric representative on the Regional Respiratory Forum 2006-
- Chair - Paediatric Regional Respiratory Forum subgroup. 2006-
- Steering Group, Strategy to reduce the burden of chronic respiratory disease, DHSSPSNI, 2004-6
- Paediatric Advisor Asthma UK N. Ireland Advisory group 2007-
- N Ireland Paediatric Intravenous Fluids care pathway Group 2005-
- Academic representative on N Ireland Paediatrics SAC, 2008-
- Subcommittee Paediatric SAC (development of Paediatric Allergy Services in N Ireland)
- Member (representing QUB, NHS and paediatrics) on Northern Ireland Forum for Health & Social Care 2003-
- Paediatric member of Hospitals Services Sub-Committee 2002-2007.
- Paediatric representative on Hospital Services Sub-committee (N Ireland) 2003-7
- Paediatric Surgical Services Working Group, 2003- (DHSSNI)
- Paediatric member to Advisory Committee for the extended training for Ambulance Officers (Paramedics), 1992-1998
- Faculty member. Emergency paediatric life support course, Royal Belf. Hosp. for Sick Children. 1992-2000
- Member of Council, Northern Ireland Chest Heart Stroke Association, Nov 1st 1997 -
- N.Ireland committee on transition to cfc-free inhalers 1998-
- Advisory Board Member for AsthmaUK 2007-
- Sitting member NICHSA Scientific Research Grants Committee (SRGC) 2012-

British Thoracic Society

- Chair: Paediatric Asthma Pharmacological Management (BTS/SIGN Guidelines) and member of Steering Group 2006-
- Chair: Paediatric Cough Management Guidelines Group 2003-

Other National Bodies

- N. Ireland representative on paediatric British Orphan Lung Disease (BOLD) Registry (BPRG). *British Paediatric Orphan Lung Disease (BPOLD)*.
<http://bpold.co.uk/condition06.php>. "Recurrent respiratory papillomatosis" Dr MD Shields

- Data Monitoring Committee NI - PIP 2009-
- BIDS Steering Group, NIHR 2011-
- NICE Quality Standard Topic Expert Group (TEG) for asthma. 2012-
- Medicines for Children research Network 2006 - 2012 Devolved countries representative on Respiratory & Cystic Fibrosis Clinical Studies Group

International Bodies

- 7th, 8th, 9th, 10th International Congress on Pediatric Pulmonology, Organising committee, Ireland representative and abstract reviewer, 2006-2009
- European Board for Accreditation in Pneumology 2010 -

Previous Statements, Depositions and Reports:

[Identify by date and title all those made in relation to the child's death]

OFFICIAL USE:

List of previous statements, depositions and reports:

| Ref: | Date: | |
|------|-------|--|
| | | |

IMPORTANT INSTRUCTIONS FOR ANSWERING:

Please attach additional sheets if more space is required. Please identify clearly any document to which you refer or rely upon for your answer. If the document has an Inquiry reference number, e.g. Ref: 049-001-001 which is 'Chart No.1 Old Notes', then please provide that number.

If the document does not have an Inquiry reference number, then please provide a copy of the document attached to your statement.

With reference to the attached diary entries dated 14th - 20th October 1996 and 21st - 27th October 1996 respectively, please provide clarification and/or further information in respect of the following:

(1) Please provide the following information:

- (a) State your medical qualifications as of 1996. MB ChB MD (Bristol University)
- (b) State the date you qualified as a medical doctor. (1979)
- (c) Describe your career history before October 1996.
Junior & Senior House Officer postings at the Royal Victoria Hospital (1979-1981)
Training rotations in Paediatrics (N Ireland) - 1981 to 1988 with a full time Research Fellowship (Paediatric cardiology) 1983-5.
Clinical fellowship in Paediatric Respiratory & Critical care Medicine, Hospital Sick Children, Toronto, Canada: 1988-1990.
Senior registrar - Paediatrics 1990-1991. Royal Belfast Hospital Sick Children
Senior Lecturer & Consultant Paediatrician Royal Belfast Hospital Sick Children & Queen's University Belfast. 1991-1996
- (d) Describe your work commitments at the RBHSC in October 1996.

Consultant paediatrician (general & respiratory): ward rounds, outpatients, consultations, training medical students and junior doctors in training. Up-until 1996 I had been audit coordinator and had established regular audit processes.

(2) Please confirm that you are the author of the attached diary entries and: YES

- (a) State if this is your work diary, personal diary, or both. BOTH
- (b) Describe your diary writing practice in 1996, including when you would typically write it up. I enter forthcoming events when I first become aware of them. I variably strike out events after they have occurred eg at end of a day and almost invariably at a weekend make sure that entries for each day during the previous week are struck out ie that the whole week is struck out. This is so that I know where to start looking for the forthcoming week. This largely remains my current practice.
 - I also strike out events eg when I have been informed that an event date has changed - contemporaneously I can tell that an event has been cancelled because the current day or week is not struck out.

- (3) Explain why each entry is struck out. See above
- (4) Explain any involvement you had in the RBHSC's application for King's Fund Organisational Audit accreditation by October 1996, including:

By 'application' I am taking this to mean the process of actually applying and filling in application forms

- (a) Your role within the application. I had NO role within the application
- (b) When the application process was begun. I do not know as I had NO role in application
- (c) The progress of the application process by October 1996. I had no role in application NOR any information about the application
- (d) The identity of the senior nurse involved in coordinating the application, including who appointed her. I do NOT know
- (e) The identity of other staff involved in the application. I do NOT know
- (5) Explain what is meant by "Mock King's Fund Survey"; I was invited to be a team member of the Mock King's Fund Survey. My recollection and understanding was that the Hospital had agreed to undertake a King's Fund Organisational Audit accreditation in the future and were keen to do a 'mock' survey so that the Hospital could become aware of any issues that they should/could address. This was in 1996 and again in 1998.

including

- (a) What was involved in the 'mock' stage of the survey. From my recollection - a team was assembled, was briefed, and met to plan how to do the 'mock survey' (where/what/how). The assessments were very wide ranging - including: fire safety (eg had staff attended lectures, were escape routes clear), were resuscitation trolleys up-to-date, did staff know where to find guidelines/information, and the standard of case notes taken)
- (b) The involvement of clinicians and hospital staff in the 'mock' survey.
- From my recollection - The members of the Mock survey team went to different units to carry out inspections. Selected managers/clinical staff (doctors and nurses) / and ancillary staff were spoken to.
- (6) Describe what took place at the "Pre-Mock" "King's Fund Org[anisation] Meeting" at "10am" on Monday 14th October 2012, including:
- (a) The meaning of "Pre-Mock" From my recollection - This was a briefing meeting
- (b) The meaning of "CR2" *Committee Room 2, King Edward Building (KEB), Royal Victoria Hospital*
- (c) Where this took place From my recollection: I am not sure if this took place in CR2 of the KEB or whether another room in either the East or West wing of the Royal Victoria Hospital was used

- (d) **Who was present at the meeting: From my recollection** – Dr J Gaston (anaesthetics, who appeared to be the Hospital Lead and most knowledgeable person about the process), myself, Dr Patricia Donnelly (Psychology), Helen Chambers (Nursing), Dr Tony Stevens (then, Occupational Health consultant). There were several other members (one senior Nurse manager). I am aware that my recollection of events is from both mock surveys (1996 and 1998). The entries in my diary mentioned above and below are related to the mock audit survey in Oct 1996 only. I recollect that a decision was made by the hospital that it would not be taking part in further King's Fund audits (I recollect this was after or at the time of the 1998 audit)
- (e) **The purpose of the meeting. From my recollection** – This was a briefing meeting
- (f) **What was discussed. From my recollection** – This was a briefing meeting. What was to be done in the mock survey, by whom, where and how.
- (7) **Describe what took place as part of the "Mock Kings Fund Survey" on Monday 21st October 1996, including:**
- (a) **The meaning of "HJS", "PB" and "MW":**
- HJS = Dr Heather J Steen. MW = Musgrave Ward.
- I cannot say for sure but think "PB" may have been initials for Patricia Beresford (with whom I had worked closely in developing audits at the Children's Hospital – she was a leading member of the audit administrative staff).
- (b) **The meaning of "Survey children's records (Must be done!)"**
- From my recollection** – I performed a review of the standard of case note write-ups at the children's hospital. I, again, recollect that I had designed a data collection form for this purpose. The 'must be done' must reflect a memo to myself that this needed to be prioritized in my work schedule for that day. I can't recollect why that was the case.
- I, also, cannot definitively recollect whether this was part of the mock King's Fund survey or one of the routine audits that I may have been carrying out. However, I believe that it was related to the mock King's Fund audit given that I do recollect that the case notes were audited at the Children's hospital as part of the King's Fund Survey and that I commented (when back with the mock survey team meeting at lunch time) on a particular finding from a surgical ward. I recollect that after this process and having noted a deficiency I expanded the case notes audit data collection form to include surgical management and drug prescribing.
- (c) **The identities of those conducting the "Mock Kings Fund Survey"**
- Dr J Gaston (anaesthetics, who appeared to be the Hospital Lead and most knowledgeable person about the King's Fund Survey process), myself, Dr Patricia Donnelly (Psychology), Helen Chambers (Nursing), Dr Tony Stevens (then, Occupational Health consultant). There were several other members (one being a senior Nurse manager).
- (d) **Who took part** - as above, although I do not recollect that the senior Nurse Manager actually took part.

- (e) **Which areas of the hospital took part** - All Royal Victoria Hospital, Royal Maternity Hospital and Royal Belfast Hospital for Sick Children. I can't remember if the Dental School was involved
- (f) **Who was tasked to visit RBHSC to do the Children's Hospital survey. From recollection** - I think I did some (but not all) of the RBHSC assessments along with either Patricia Donnelly or Helen Chambers
- (8) **Explain the purpose of your meeting with Dr George Murnaghan at 3pm on 21st October 1996, including:** I do not recollect what the purpose of this meeting. I had regular meetings with Dr Murnaghan regarding audits.
- (a) **The meaning of [REDACTED]**. This is someone's name. I am not sure if this was a member of staff or a patient's name (in which case it should have been blackened out). Dr George Murnaghan was the overall hospital audit lead and was the person who most encouraged/convinced me that improvements could be made through audits.
- (9) **Describe what took place as part of the "Kings Fund Survey" on Tuesday 22nd October 1996, including:**
- (a) **Whether the "Kings Fund Survey" on Tuesday 22nd October 1996 was also a 'mock' survey.** I recollect and believe that this was the case - it was part of the mock audit/survey. I had nothing to do with the 'real' King's Fund Survey
- (b) **The identities of those conducting the "Kings Fund Survey".** Those named in the mock audit team (NB - my recollection of the 1996 mock survey may be mixed with memories from the 1998 survey)
- (c) **Who took part.** Those named in the team and those staff asked to be interviewed.
- (d) **Which areas of the hospital took part.** The Royal Victoria Hospital, Royal Maternity and Royal Belfast Hospital for Sick Children. From my recollection I did some assessments in the Children's Hospital, Royal Maternity Hospital and in 2 of the adult wards in the main corridor of the Royal Victoria Hospital
- (e) **How long the exercise took.** I recollect and believe the mock survey took 2 days - Monday the 21st and Tuesday 22nd October 1996
- (f) **Who was tasked to visit RBHSC to do the Children's Hospital survey. From recollection** - I think I did some (but not all) of the RBHSC assessments along with either Patricia Donnelly or Helen Chambers.

(10) In particular, please state if Dr Heather Steen was involved with any part of the "Kings Fund Survey" on Tuesday 22nd October 1996, and if so:

I have clearly an entry in my diary for 9am on the morning of Monday the 21st Oct 1996 that I was to meet with Dr Heather Steen in Musgrave Ward (MW) in the Children's Hospital.

I can clearly remember obtaining case notes from the children's hospital, and sitting in the seminar room of Musgrave Ward (MW) and checking how well they met the King's Fund standards. I vaguely recollect, and it is likely, given what is recorded in my diary that Dr Steen was somewhat and somehow involved in this process. I'm not sure if she was also assessing the case notes or was in some other way facilitating the process.

I am not sure and cannot recollect whether Dr Heather Steen was interviewed by other members of the mock survey team on Tuesday 22nd October.

(a) Describe her involvement and state for what purpose she was involved

I cannot confirm or recollect what her role was

(b) State what times she began and finished her involvement

I cannot determine this. My diary has an entry that I was to meet Dr Heather Steen at 9am on Monday 21st Oct 1996 in Musgrave ward.

(c) State for what period of time she was involved in assisting the Survey

I cannot say or recollect

(d) Where she would have been during her involvement, and how far away this location was from Allen Ward in the RBHSC.

On Monday morning 21st Oct 1996 it would appear that Dr Steen was with me in Musgrave Ward. Musgrave Ward is within the Children's Hospital and approximately 50 - 75 yards and a small flight of steps up from Allen Ward.

(11) Provide any further points and comments that you wish to make, together with any documents

I believe it is quite likely that Dr Heather Steen would have been interviewed by the mock survey team - given that she had a detailed knowledge of the hospital from an operational position and that she was one of the consultants most likely to be free. At this time many of the consultant paediatricians were joint appointments with Queen's University Belfast and had other commitments and or worked jointly between the Children's Hospital and the neonatal unit/community services in the Royal Maternity Hospital or one of the community trusts. Like these consultants Dr Steen did have commitments to community clinics. This is my recollection of events of 16 years ago, jogged by my diary entries, and to the best of my knowledge is accurate. I recollect that there was another Kings Fund mock Survey 2 years later.

THIS STATEMENT IS TRUE TO THE BEST OF MY KNOWLEDGE AND BELIEF

Michael A. Shield

Signed:

Dated: 30th Oct 2012

October Mock Kings Fund Survey

1996

| | 9am | 11.15 - P.B. | M.W. | Evening |
|-----------|-------|--|------|-----------|
| Monday | 21/10 | Survey children's records (what to be done!) | | |
| week 43 | | 2.05pm ICS - H. O'Hare | | |
| Tuesday | * 22 | Kings Fund Survey (all day) | | |
| | | 6.30pm U.S. Dinahy Tur | | |
| Wednesday | 23 | AR - off | | |
| | | 2pm KD. (include ME name) | | |
| Thursday | 24 | 9AM [redacted] | | |
| Friday | 25 | Away - all day | | |
| Saturday | 26 | Meningococcal disease | | Symposium |
| Sunday | 27 | | | |

on call

British Summer Time ends

October

1996

| | | Morning | Afternoon | Evening |
|-----------|----|------------------------------------|----------------------|------------|
| Monday | 14 | | | |
| Pre-break | | King Fund Org Meeting B. Cow - CR2 | | |
| | | 2pm [redacted] | | |
| week 42 | | | | |
| Tuesday | 15 | | | |
| | | 9am [redacted] | 9-30-10am [redacted] | |
| | | Wash. Inst. Rom - Prolecture | | |
| Wednesday | 16 | | | |
| | | AR off | Hangar | Prolecture |
| | | 2pm Meeting J. [redacted] | | |
| | | 3-30pm G. M. [redacted] | | |
| Thursday | 17 | | | |
| | | 2pm [redacted] | | |
| | | 8:30pm [redacted] | | |
| Friday | 18 | | | |
| | | 2pm [redacted] Special [redacted] | | |
| | | Dept. meeting [redacted] Symposium | | |
| | | ARC [redacted] | | |
| Saturday | 19 | | | |
| Sunday | 20 | | | |